Hannah DeMatteo

Lesson 11: Article Analysis

April 9th, 2023

Formulation of Problem

- State the issues or general problems being addressed.

This article addresses the problem of increased physical health issues that, according to the article, are proven to be a threat to those suffering from serious mental health issues (Moon). The article discusses how these physical health problems pertain to a shorter lifespan expectancy for those with serious mental illness. The life expectancy gap between the general population and those with SMI are 25-30 years (Moon). Those with SMI are seen to lead a more unhealthy lifestyle which is seen to be the cause of premature death and obesity triggered health complications (Moon).

- State the purpose of the study.

The purpose of this study is to see if there is significant improvement in the physical and mental health of those with SMI when introduced to the clubhouse model, a community based program that provides support for those with mental illness through employment, educational support, housing assistance, social activities and mental health services. This article focuses on the efficacy of the Clubhouse Structured Exercise program which works with participants within the same clubhouse structure but is additionally emphasizing regular physical activity through group workouts that will be encouraging and engaging, with the intention of promoting social and emotional benefits including improved self-esteem, physical health and overall quality of life in those that suffer from SMI.

Research Questions and Hypothesis

- List the research question(s). If researchers did not address it in the paper, you should create it.

The research question stated in this article is the following, "Do participants in the CSE program have positive effects on perceived physical and mental health of the participants?" and "Is participation in the CSE program associated with increases in health-related psychosocial factors such as health self-efficacy, health motivation and self-esteem?" and lastly "How do members experience the motivational and behavioral process of adopting and maintaining an exercise routine during participation in the CSE?"

- State the research hypotheses. If researchers did not address it, you should create it.

I did not discover a written hypothesis from the researchers, however, I believe that the hypothesis is the following. Regular participation of the SMI in physical health activity through CSE programs will lead to improvements in physical health, mental health and overall quality of life.

Important Factors Identified in the Study

- Specify the following factors: target problems (dependent variable[s]; e.g., suicidal ideation), factors associated with or affecting the target problems (independent variable[s]; e.g., social network), and the study population (e.g., domestic violence victims).

The dependent variables involved in this article include, physical health, mental health and quality of life in individuals with SMI. The independent variable is the Clubhouse Structured Exercise Programs. Finally, the target population are people with Serious Mental Illness involved in Clubhouse programming.

- Is there sufficient support that the current study addresses a weakness or a gap in previous research? Why?

Previous research helped the study when it came to data analysis. The researchers had access to studies done previously and compared the qualitative data to use as support for the research. There is not much acknowledged about previous research done otherwise in this article.

Research Design

- Qualitative or quantitative?

Both qualitative and quantitative data has been done in this article. Quantitative data was scored and coded using SPSS. Surveys were used in a quantitative fashion including psychosocial factors. Qualitative analysis was used through in person interviews that were recorded with the intention of obtaining a unique model of the SCE Program through live experiences of participants.

- Exploratory, descriptive, or explanatory?

Descriptive analysis was used in this article for the purpose of exploring socio demographic data of the target population. This would include, gender, age, how long they have been a clubhouse attendee, exercise regularity and employment status.

- Cross-sectional or longitudinal?

This article used cross-sectional studies for research.

- Discuss whether this design is appropriate to address the research question (i.e., is this the best design for addressing the question? Or do you want to suggest a different design?).

I do believe that this research design was effective and appropriate for the research question because of the ease of finding data quickly and effectively.

Sampling

- Describe the target population, the study population, and the sample size

The target population for this study was individuals with SMI who participated in the CSE program through the clubhouse model. This accumulated to 25 participants between two major clubhouses. According to the article, 17 of them had no prior experience with regular exercise and 22 of them had no experience prior to joining the CSE program.

- Sampling design: probability or non-probability? Also, specify the type of sampling technique used in the study, if applicable.

This article used a non-probability sampling design because it was necessary to obtain participants with a certain type of eligibility and to meet a certain criteria to be involved, therefore, it was not random and would be considered a convenience sample.

- Discuss eligibility and inclusion criteria if applicable.

The study population included individuals who were over the age of 18, officially diagnosed with SMI, had medical permission to be physically active and finally, were able to attend at least 2 group classes a week for 4 months.

- Describe the major strengths and limitations of the sampling plan.

The strengths of this sampling plan is curating the sample of individuals in order to obtain the best possible research and understanding of the CSE program's efficacy in individuals that would apply for the intervention in the first place. This sampling is strong because the specifications do not lead to sampling bias, the research found from this sampling can contribute to the conclusions for the intended population. The limitations of this sampling plan may involve difficulty leaning on the research for statistical inferences. This is because, it is not a random selection of individuals with SMI from clubhouse programs as a whole, instead it is only a selection of individuals who fall within this category who have the physical ability to participate

in physical activities, therefore, you cannot assume that the population in general can apply to the results coming from the group that was chosen in this specific sampling. As well as this, due to being exclusive with participants, a smaller sample size was studied and therefore, may not hold as much weight statistically.

Conceptualization and Measurements

- List major variables in the study (e.g., independent, dependent, controlling, moderating, and mediating variables).

In the conceptualization and measurement process, the independent variables involve the tactics used within the CSE program. This is regular exercise at least twice a week for 4 months. The dependent variables from the article are the following. Health motivation for physical activity in a participant, self-efficacy of health in participants, level of self-esteem based on Rosenberg's scale and finally, perceived mental and physical health. Other variables in this study include Age, gender, race, how many years a person has been attending the clubhouse as well as employment status.

- Describe the operational definitions of the major study variables (this is regarding how to measure the variables).

The variables were measured and analyzed through a sample t-test. Researchers conducted a pre-test and post-test about a year later. The researcher combined the samples of both clubhouses that included surveys of ten scales associated with psychosocial factors. The researcher also conducted interviews that were coded into qualitative data.

- Is there any evidence of the reliability and validity of these measures in the paper?

The evidence was found to be reliable because the scales were measured by the SPSS program. The article also states that the test-retest reliability for SF-12 among people with SMI was tested by ICCs that shows substantial reliability of the measures in the paper (Moon).

- Discuss the major strengths and limitations of the measures.

The strengths of these measures is that they were found to have validity and could be relied upon. These measures lead to an appropriate and effective way towards gathering findings that enlighten us about clubhouses around the world and its efficacy towards the wellbeing of those with SMI. Limitations of these measures remain to be the minimal amount of people that were involved in the study in order to gain a substantial amount of data.

Data Collection

- Discuss when, where, how, and by whom data were collected (e.g., face-to-face interviews, telephone interviews, mail survey, web-based survey, self-administered questionnaires, or case record reviews).

In regard to data collection, surveys were conducted in the Genesis Club and the Independence Center, two clubhouses using clubhouse programs. This was initially done in January of 2013 and the post tests took place at the same places in May of 2014. These surveys were administered by PhD Candidates at Simmons College. Interviews were conducted with four members and one staff member of the Genesis Club from March to April of 2014. These surveys were done while the CSE Program was in process and all interviews were in person and tape recorded.

- Discuss the major strengths and limitations of the data collection plan.

The strengths of this data collection plan is that it is direct and goes straight to the source for data. Not only do we have data on the people participating in the CSE program, but we also

have in-depth understanding of the participants' experience through interviews. Therefore, I believe the data collection lends itself to compelling evidence. However, the limitations lead to a small sample size.which resulted in the need to combine data from two different places instead of comparing data, which may have been more impactful evidence.

Findings and Discussion

- Briefly summarize the main findings of the study.

According to the article, this study proved the importance of structured exercise programs in the wellness of those with SMI. There was seen to be significant improvement in their psychosocial health, including, motivation to exercise, self-esteem increase and a positive change in lifestyle and health outcomes.

- Did the results match the study hypotheses? Are implications for practice and/or policy discussed?

The results of this study did in fact match the study hypothesis and leads to the researchers believing the conclusions have strong implications for practice outside of just clubhouse programs. The conclusion of the study describes the desire to replicate the CSE program for other mental health service programs. As well as the hope that this research can influence policy makers and mental health professionals to involve exercise in the wellness services that are provided for all people with SMI.