

Model Evaluation: Five Approaches Overview

Nicauris Ubiera

Nyack College

Evaluation of Integration Model

Identification of Model: LEVELS OF EXPLANATION

Epistemology

_____ There is a comprehensive view of Scripture and the avoidance of either a tendency to ignore Scripture or to proof text.

Psychological theory and research are reviewed and integrated into this model.

Comment:

This approach establishes that Science provides support for the bible and theology. However, occasionally, science will challenge traditional Christian understanding. In order for a person to grow internally, externally and spiritually, there are different levels that need to be explored. This model includes the examination of the following levels in an individual. These levels are the following: psychological, social and spiritual. These levels are evidence based.

Appreciation for Science of Psychology

A specific theory is easily identified (e.g., Freudian, Adlerian, Behavioral, Cognitive, Neuroscience, etc.) or model is clearly identified as eclectic.

_____ The author is conversant with research and does not use psychological “proof-texting.”

Comment:

This approach cannot be identified as eclectic. It shows little correlation between psychological science and the scriptures. However, it has documented a positive correlation between active faith and human health and happiness.

Relationship of Psychology and Theology

A specific family of theology is easily identified (e.g., Reformed, Wesleyan, Evangelical, Charismatic, etc.) or the model is clearly identified as eclectic.

_____ The author’s use of the term “integration” is clearly explained.

Comment:

Levels of explanation approach explains that the relationship between psychology and theology are distinct. Moreover, the psychological view is value free nonetheless the spiritual view is all based on personal values and not based on facts.

View of Humanity

_____ The model takes into account a Biblical view of humanity.

This view is informed from both theology and psychology.

Comment:

This approach emphasizes that the counselor should take what science and practice has to offer and apply that knowledge to the challenges the person is facing. However, it explores different assessments that will get the counselor evaluate the client's spiritual life.

Role of Christ and Holy Spirit

_____ The role of the cross of Christ is clearly delineated.

The role of the Holy Spirit is addressed.

Comment:

Even though the approach does not specifically mention the role of Christ and the Holy Spirit in the client's life it illustrates spiritual tools that can be integrated into counseling such as meditation, prayer, vocation, meaning and purpose and calling in life. These tools will provide direction and purpose in the client's life.

Nature of Health and Disorder

The goal of growth includes both psychological health and spiritual maturity and these goals are clearly defined.

_____ A distinction between spiritual and psychological suffering is made.

_____ Disorder is clearly explained (e.g., A view of sin versus psychopathology is clearly articulated)

_____ A place is given for physical symptoms (and appropriate medical referrals are suggested).

Comment:

This approach establishes that "Psychological science enlivens ancient biblical wisdom about human nature" (Greggo & Sisemore, 2012). However, science and practice can be used to understand human behavior and use this model to improve healthy human functioning.

Nature of change

The model makes use of psychological techniques, biblical truth and spiritual disciplines.

_____ The role of the counselor is clearly delineated.

_____ The contrast between symptom reduction, positive mental health and spiritual maturity is addressed in a cohesive fashion.

Comment:

This model makes use of psychological techniques as a tool to improve human

behavior. Moreover, it defines the role of the counselor as a coach guiding and helping the client make progress, and have a more productive and healthy promoting life.

Use of Religious Techniques and Practices

If the use of religious or spiritual techniques with clients is recommended, this is done within a framework of professional ethics.

The model clearly describes whether these techniques are used for psychological or spiritual goals.

Comment:

The biopsychosocial spiritual approach examines the interaction among these levels in order to improve the client's life, how they function in society and how to solve their problems. There are key treatment techniques to be applied from this approach. For example: The biological level examines if the client has a cognitive impairment. The psychological level examines what the client feels and thinks. However, the social level examines how socially connected the individual is with people that surrounds him/her. On the other hand, the spiritual level explores the client's spiritual and or religious involvement and his/her relationship with God.

Overall Assessment

This model can be easily incorporated into clinical practice? (Which, if any, settings would be more difficult?)

I would refer my mother to a therapist using this model.

Comment:

This model can be easily used within the general public and within the Christian community. It allows the client to improve quality of life, make progress in areas of their lives that need work and the client can have a healthy promoting life.

Identification of Model: INTEGRATION APPROACH

Epistemology

There is a comprehensive view of Scripture and the avoidance of either a tendency to ignore Scripture or to proof text.

Psychological theory and research are reviewed and integrated into this

model.

Comment:

This model is an integration of biblical truth, science and rational argumentation. Moreover, it conducts science and psychology in a way shaped first and fundamentally by Christian convictions. Moreover, it explains the balance between psychology, theology and spirituality. It presents humans were created to the image of God, however this concept is only examined through the functional, structural and relational aspects of the individual.

Appreciation for Science of Psychology

A specific theory is easily identified (e.g., Freudian, Adlerian, Behavioral, Cognitive, Neuroscience, etc.) or model is clearly identified as eclectic.
 The author is conversant with research and does not use psychological “proof-texting.”

Comment:

The integration approach has an inclination to the Freudian theory when evaluating psychological reductionism. However, this model also explores other areas and it is a combination of balance between psychology, theology and spirituality. The main goal is to reach psycho spiritual wholeness.

Relationship of Psychology and Theology

A specific family of theology is easily identified (e.g., Reformed, Wesleyan, Evangelical, Charismatic, etc.) or the model is clearly identified as eclectic.
 The author’s use of the term “integration” is clearly explained.

Comment:

This model is an integration model. It tries to balance psychology, theology and spirituality without diminishing the value of each. It explores psychological and spiritual reductionism, how psychology absorbs spirituality and vice versa. Finally it explores how the individual can reach psychospiritual wholeness.

View of Humanity

The model takes into account a Biblical view of humanity.
 This view is informed from both theology and psychology.

Comment:

This approach examines from a Christian perspective: human condition, human behavior and measures of humility. Moreover, it emphasizes that the scriptures cannot be examined without having in mind human error. Nonetheless, it recognizes that “science is a value-laden enterprise and that psychological science can prove helpful in the work counselors do” (Greggo & Sisemore, 2012).

Role of Christ and Holy Spirit

_____ The role of the cross of Christ is clearly delineated.

___X___ The role of the Holy Spirit is addressed.

Comment:

This approach does not exactly examine the role of Christ or the Holy Spirit in the client’s life. However, it illustrates humans created to the image of God (imago Dei). This means that humans were given certain characteristics and responsibilities that are unique to its race and that no other living being (animals) share nor have these God-like qualities and responsibilities.

Nature of Health and Disorder

___X___ The goal of growth includes both psychological health and spiritual maturity and these goals are clearly defined.

_____ A distinction between spiritual and psychological suffering is made.

_____ Disorder is clearly explained (e.g., A view of sin versus psychopathology is clearly articulated)

_____ A place is given for physical symptoms (and appropriate medical referrals are suggested).

Comment:

This model explains that in order for the client to reach psychological health it will need to have a theological notion/understanding of the imago Dei.

Nature of change

_____ The model makes use of psychological techniques, biblical truth and spiritual disciplines.

_____ The role of the counselor is clearly delineated.

___X___ The contrast between symptom reduction, positive mental health and spiritual maturity is addressed in a cohesive fashion.

Comment:

This approach can use different techniques to enhance quality of life of the client. For example: the counselor can explore and emphasize the role of empathy, genuineness and positive regard. Moreover, it can be put to practice cognitive-behavioral strategies to examine and challenge the client's way of thinking. However, before implementing cognitive rehabilitation, the counselor should be aware there are no psychological impairments in the client.

Use of Religious Techniques and Practices

If the use of religious or spiritual techniques with clients is recommended, this is done within a framework of professional ethics.

The model clearly describes whether these techniques are used for psychological or spiritual goals.

Comment:

This model uses spiritual awareness and techniques as a source of hope and resilience. The way a client can improve quality of life and purpose is by understanding the significance of being created to the imago Dei.

Overall Assessment

This model can be easily incorporated into clinical practice? (Which, if any, settings would be more difficult?)

I would refer my mother to a therapist using this model.

Comment:

This model cannot be easily incorporated into counseling due to the fact that "it requires a graduate level of training and advanced supervision before a counselor should be considered qualified" (Greggo & Sisemore, p.107). It is important for the counselor to be qualified in training because it can cause substantial damage.

Identification of Model: CHRISTIAN PSYCHOLOGY APPROACH

Epistemology

There is a comprehensive view of Scripture and the avoidance of either a tendency to ignore Scripture or to proof text.

Psychological theory and research are reviewed and integrated into this model.

Comment:

This counseling approach examines counseling from two perspectives. First, in order

for the therapeutic alliance to be effective, the guidance of the Spirit of God is needed. Second, the word of God has to be used as the manual or guide for the client to overcome their problems and to grow mentally and spiritually.

Appreciation for Science of Psychology

A specific theory is easily identified (e.g., Freudian, Adlerian, Behavioral, Cognitive, Neuroscience, etc.) or model is clearly identified as eclectic.
 The author is conversant with research and does not use psychological “proof-texting.”

Comment:

This model can be identified as eclectic. The focus of this approach is on the “philosophy, theology, theory, research, and clinical skills and techniques that constitute a Christian psychology” (Greggo & Sisemore, p. 111).

Relationship of Psychology and Theology

A specific family of theology is easily identified (e.g., Reformed, Wesleyan, Evangelical, Charismatic, etc.) or the model is clearly identified as eclectic.
 The author’s use of the term “integration” is clearly explained.

Comment:

This model can be identified as eclectic. However, it analyzes how clinical research and the three phase model for working with victims of trauma are used in treatment aimed to enhance the client’s Christian faith.

View of Humanity

The model takes into account a Biblical view of humanity.
 This view is informed from both theology and psychology.

Comment:

The model takes into account a Biblical view of humanity. It recognizes God as the Creator and it shows Christ as the savior and the person to imitate and follow. Moreover, it emphasizes the role of the Holy Spirit and the Scriptures as the guide and conduct manual for every human being. The counselor’s understanding of humanity must be based on the study, understanding and application of the person of the Son of Man.

Role of Christ and Holy Spirit

- The role of the cross of Christ is clearly delineated.
 The role of the Holy Spirit is addressed.

Comment:

This approach is ultimately based on the knowledge of the character and personality of Christ. By understanding the nature of the Son of God and helping the client image Christ's nature in their behavior, the client can become a whole and healthy human person just like the Son. "He is not only the model of what we are to be; He is also God in the flesh ministering to wounded humanity" (Greggo & Sisemore, p.113).

Nature of Health and Disorder

- The goal of growth includes both psychological health and spiritual maturity and these goals are clearly defined.
 A distinction between spiritual and psychological suffering is made.
 Disorder is clearly explained (e.g., A view of sin versus psychopathology is clearly articulated)
 A place is given for physical symptoms (and appropriate medical referrals are suggested).

Comment:

This model emphasizes the marvelous work of Christ in the person's life where the therapist is able to watch the remarkable power of God, His Son and His Word restoring the broken one. Restoring a wounded life, the counselor's and the client's life and they both begin to reflect qualities of Christ through their lives into the world.

Nature of change

- The model makes use of psychological techniques, biblical truth and spiritual disciplines.
 The role of the counselor is clearly delineated.
 The contrast between symptom reduction, positive mental health and spiritual maturity is addressed in a cohesive fashion.

Comment:

The therapist is the human tool and a very important agent of help in the therapeutic alliance. He/she has to be rooted in the Word of God and have a close relationship with God so that all knowledge and intervention comes from God. Moreover, the therapist has to be "a representation of the character of Christ, and that character must shape the therapist, the client and the relationship between them"... "Modeling is a vital part of the counseling process" (Greggo & Sisemore, p. 111).

Use of Religious Techniques and Practices

If the use of religious or spiritual techniques with clients is recommended, this is done within a framework of professional ethics.

The model clearly describes whether these techniques are used for psychological or spiritual goals.

Comment:

This model of counseling has a three phase plan. In the first step it helps the client to feel safe and stabilized. The second step guides the client to process trauma (if any). Lastly, the therapist and the client will explore the client's connection with the world around him. At the end of treatment it is expected that the client understands their purpose in life, to have a solid foundation of what they want for their future and model Christ in everything they do so that they can have a godly and productive life.

Overall Assessment

This model can be easily incorporated into clinical practice? (Which, if any, settings would be more difficult?)

I would refer my mother to a therapist using this model.

Comment:

This model can be easily incorporated into Christian clinical practice. This is one of the limitations it presents, it is designed only for the Christian community. This approach relies entirely on the work of God, the Son, the Holy Spirit and the visual guidance of the Bible. Moreover, the work of therapy will not only work on the client but on the therapist as well. The person of Christ has to be visible in the therapist and taught to the client.

Identification of Model: TRANSFORMATIONAL APPROACH**Epistemology**

There is a comprehensive view of Scripture and the avoidance of either a tendency to ignore Scripture or to proof text.

Psychological theory and research are reviewed and integrated into this model.

Comment:

The main focus of this approach is to bring the person into sharper focus. This model can be viewed as the BASIC ID with a soul.

Appreciation for Science of Psychology

A specific theory is easily identified (e.g., Freudian, Adlerian, Behavioral, Cognitive, Neuroscience, etc.) or model is clearly identified as eclectic.

The author is conversant with research and does not use psychological “proof-texting.”

Comment:

This approach discusses the relationship between the social sciences and Christianity. It also examines Christian spiritual formation with the professional practice of counseling and psychotherapy.

Relationship of Psychology and Theology

A specific family of theology is easily identified (e.g., Reformed, Wesleyan, Evangelical, Charismatic, etc.) or the model is clearly identified as eclectic.

The author’s use of the term “integration” is clearly explained.

Comment:

This model can be examined from an integration perspective. It has a primary focus on the relationship between modern applied psychology and spiritual formation. Benner (1998) called this approach “a spiritual sensitive approach to psychotherapy” (Greggo & Sisemore, p.135). This approach presents the soul and spirit as essential to the functioning of a human being. The model creates a hierarchy of value from various schools of psychology. For example, it uses neuropsychology and biology to explain human behavior. Moreover, it also examines behavioral and cognitive approaches to understand human behavior and functioning.

View of Humanity

The model takes into account a Biblical view of humanity.

This view is informed from both theology and psychology.

Comment:

This approach proposes there are six basic aspects of a human being, which together interact with one another to make up human nature. It examines the spirit, will and heart because it is the center/core of the person’s life. Moreover, the individual cannot function separately nor apart from God.

Role of Christ and Holy Spirit

The role of the cross of Christ is clearly delineated.

The role of the Holy Spirit is addressed.

Comment:

This approach acknowledges the existence and purpose of Christ in the individual's Life. The client should be aware of what Jesus has to offer into their lives and reposition their faith in Christ and live interactively with Him.

Nature of Health and Disorder

The goal of growth includes both psychological health and spiritual maturity and these goals are clearly defined.

A distinction between spiritual and psychological suffering is made.

Disorder is clearly explained (e.g., A view of sin versus psychopathology is clearly articulated)

A place is given for physical symptoms (and appropriate medical referrals are suggested).

Comment:

This model is a person-centered approach that provides a holistic way of conceptualizing and working with individuals that easily embraces abnormal psychology, positive psychology and the soul/spirit.

Nature of change

The model makes use of psychological techniques, biblical truth and spiritual disciplines.

The role of the counselor is clearly delineated.

The contrast between symptom reduction, positive mental health and spiritual maturity is addressed in a cohesive fashion.

Comment:

The model uses techniques such as 1) improving maladaptive functioning, 2) improve positive thinking and 3) enhancing Christian spiritual formation.

Use of Religious Techniques and Practices

If the use of religious or spiritual techniques with clients is recommended, this is done within a framework of professional ethics.

The model clearly describes whether these techniques are used for psychological or spiritual goals.

Comment:

This approach believes the client would be most healthy when they are living in close alignment with God and with His Son. Physical and psychological healthy functioning can be obtained by submitting to God's will and letting His power and

presence transform the client. Treatment plans and techniques are the following: exploring the client's current situation or problematic, help the client understand where they are standing emotionally and spiritually and lastly, the counselor provides change strategies.

Overall Assessment

This model can be easily incorporated into clinical practice? (Which, if any, settings would be more difficult?)

I would refer my mother to a therapist using this model.

Comment:

A counselor who is equally trained in mental health discipline and spiritual formation is able to help a client in a holistic manner. This approach can only be practiced by a therapist that is competent and knowledgeable in mental health and in spiritual formation.

Identification of Model: BIBLICAL COUNSELING

Epistemology

There is a comprehensive view of Scripture and the avoidance of either a tendency to ignore Scripture or to proof text.

Psychological theory and research are reviewed and integrated into this model.

Comment:

This approach relies thoroughly on the guidance and knowledge provided by the Holy Spirit, the Word of God and the ministry of the church. The church serves as an auxiliary tool working together with the counselor for the benefit of the client.

Appreciation for Science of Psychology

A specific theory is easily identified (e.g., Freudian, Adlerian, Behavioral, Cognitive, Neuroscience, etc.) or model is clearly identified as eclectic.
 The author is conversant with research and does not use psychological “proof-texting.”

Comment:

This counseling approach is biblically founded and it focuses on the well-being and wholeness of the person through the work of God.

Relationship of Psychology and Theology

A specific family of theology is easily identified (e.g., Reformed, Wesleyan, Evangelical, Charismatic, etc.) or the model is clearly identified as eclectic.
 The author’s use of the term “integration” is clearly explained.

Comment:

This model focuses on the condition of the soul, the function of the heart and God’s plan to work in an individual resulting in change through the application of the Bible.

View of Humanity

The model takes into account a Biblical view of humanity.
 This view is informed from both theology and psychology.

Comment:

This approach takes into account a Biblical view of humanity. Creation is traced back from Adam and Eve and so is sin. This model does not account personal problems as a result of sin. However, sin can lead to psychological and spiritual problems.

Role of Christ and Holy Spirit

The role of the cross of Christ is clearly delineated.
 The role of the Holy Spirit is addressed.

Comment:

This model acknowledges that all progress in an individual is a result of the client’s submission to God, the application of His Word to their lives and their relationship with the Holy Spirit. Through proper worship and biblical thinking the individual can experience God’s transforming work.

Nature of Health and Disorder

The goal of growth includes both psychological health and spiritual maturity and these goals are clearly defined.

A distinction between spiritual and psychological suffering is made.

Disorder is clearly explained (e.g., A view of sin versus psychopathology is clearly articulated)

A place is given for physical symptoms (and appropriate medical referrals are suggested).

Comment:

This approach establishes that true help and change can only occur as the client comes to know, trust and embrace who God really is in their lives.

Nature of change

The model makes use of psychological techniques, biblical truth and spiritual disciplines.

The role of the counselor is clearly delineated.

The contrast between symptom reduction, positive mental health and spiritual maturity is addressed in a cohesive fashion.

Comment:

This model makes use of psychological techniques, the bible and spiritual disciplines. For example, a session can consist of the following: the counselor starting with a prayer (asking God for wisdom), then go over any given homework or assignment to do over the week. Next, the counselor can dialogue through biblical principles and help the client make applications to his/her own life. Lastly, the counselor can assign homework, bring encouragement, provide hope and offer comfort to the client and finally pray to end the session.

Use of Religious Techniques and Practices

If the use of religious or spiritual techniques with clients is recommended, this is done within a framework of professional ethics.

The model clearly describes whether these techniques are used for psychological or spiritual goals.

Comment:

This model applies three basic techniques: 1) gracious care, 2) biblical truth and 3) specific application of God's word. The gospel application in someone's life does not negate the need of other biblical elements of change. For example, exercising repentance, accountability of own weak flesh, attending bible studies and being

involved in church.

Overall Assessment

_____ This model can be easily incorporated into clinical practice? (Which, if any, settings would be more difficult?)

___X___ I would refer my mother to a therapist using this model.

Comment:

This counselor in training who is a church leader would refer to biblical counseling those church members who are struggling with a sense of self and purpose. This approach can only be applied to the Christian community. It is based on the work of God in the person's life through His word. Moreover, God will use His church as a helping tool used for spiritual guidance and to promote the individual's spiritual growth. This model is designed to bring change in a person who is facing spiritual and personal difficulties and challenges.

Reference

Greggo, S.P., & Sisemore, T. (Eds). (2012). *Counseling and christianity: five approaches*. Downers Grove, IL: Intervarsity Press.

Jones, S.L. in Johnson, E.L. (2010). *Psychology & christianity: five views*. P. 116-117

