

Evaluation of Integration Models Worksheet

Jacqueline Butler

Nyack College

APPENDIX B Evaluation of Integration Model

Describe the model you are examining using each of the following categories. For each subcategory, rate on a scale of 1 to 5 (with 5 representing an “ideal” approach). Write supporting comments.

LEVELS OF EXPLANATION

Identification of Model: _____

Epistemology

- 2 There is a comprehensive view of Scripture and the avoidance of either a tendency to ignore Scripture or to proof text.
 3 Psychological theory and research are reviewed and integrated into this model.

Comment:

This model does not include scriptures but includes spirituality since spirituality has been proven to be important to many people. This model is based on science so theory and research are seen as being reviewed and integrated.

Appreciation for Science of Psychology

- 3 A specific theory is easily identified (e.g., Freudian, Adlerian, Behavioral, Cognitive, Neuroscience, etc.) or model is clearly identified as eclectic.
 4 The author is conversant with research and does not use psychological “proof-texting.”

Comment:

The model uses multifaceted approach to manage various issues. It appears to selectively apply techniques to fit the need which is eclectic. There does not appear to be any statement that was taken out of context within the understanding of a biopsychosocial spiritual approach that is based upon science.

Relationship of Psychology and Theology

- 1 A specific family of theology is easily identified (e.g., Reformed, Wesleyan, Evangelical, Charismatic, etc.) or the model is clearly identified as eclectic.
 1 The author’s use of the term “integration” is clearly explained.

Comment:

The spiritual level does not reference the Bible or Christ. Spirituality references the client’s spiritual system. The author does not mention integration which is problematic.

View of Humanity

- 1 The model takes into account a Biblical view of humanity.
 1 This view is informed from both theology and psychology.

Comment:

This model does not consider a Biblical view of humanity it only considers the client’s spiritual system. The view is not informed from the perspective of theology and psychology. It is a scientifically informed approach that assess and conceptualizes 4 levels – biology, psychology, social and spiritual.

Role of Christ and Holy Spirit

- 1 The role of the cross of Christ is clearly delineated.
 1 The role of the Holy Spirit is addressed.

Comment:

Although this model discusses Christ and the Holy Spirit, it does not appear delineated. The spiritual level is an open or fluid concept because it can refer to many different things. It does not necessarily refer to Christ or the Holy Spirit.

Nature of Health and Disorder

- 4 The goal of growth includes both psychological health and spiritual maturity and these goals are clearly defined.
- 5 A distinction between spiritual and psychological suffering is made.
- 3 Disorder is clearly explained (e.g., A view of sin versus psychopathology is clearly articulated)
- 5 A place is given for physical symptoms (and appropriate medical referrals are suggested).

Comment:

The goal is growth in all levels. Any dysfunction at any level will lead to dysregulation in other levels. There is a distinction made of the possible different type of suffering stemming from all of the levels which include spiritual and psychological. While there is no view of sin versus psychopathology, the disorder is articulated as a systems theory approach where each level is triaged. So, physical symptoms that have possible underlying issues would be referred to appropriate medical consults.

Nature of change

- 2 The model makes use of psychological techniques, biblical truth and spiritual disciplines.
- 5 The role of the counselor is clearly delineated.
- 2 The contrast between symptom reduction, positive mental health and spiritual maturity is addressed in a cohesive fashion.

Comment:

The model does use psychological techniques and spiritual disciplines but does not include biblical truths because the spiritual level is not necessarily Christian. The role of the counselor is delineated as the counselor should be forming an alliance and addressing each level.

Use of Religious Techniques and Practices

- 5 If the use of religious or spiritual techniques with clients is recommended, this is done within a framework of professional ethics.
- 5 The model clearly describes whether these techniques are used for psychological or spiritual goals.

Comment:

Spiritual techniques are recommended and are within the professional ethics framework. The model delineates spiritual techniques for spiritual goals and psychological techniques for psychological goals.

Overall Assessment

- 5 This model can be easily incorporated into clinical practice? (Which, if any, settings would be more difficult?)
- 5 I would refer my mother to a therapist using this model.

Comment:

This biopsychosocial spiritual approach can be used in any setting and might be preferable in a substance abuse setting. Since my mother is suffering from dementia, I would refer her to a counselor using this model as consideration has to be given to the biological dimension.

Adapted by Dr. Fred Gingrich from original items which are attributed to Tim Sisemore in McMinn, M. R., Moon, G. W., & McCormick, A. G. (2009). Integration in the classroom: Ten teaching strategies. *Journal of Psychology and Theology*, 37(1), p. 4

Evaluation of Integration Model

Describe the model you are examining using each of the following categories. For each subcategory, rate on a scale of 1 to 5 (with 5 representing an “ideal” approach). Write supporting comments.

Identification of Model: _____ INTEGRATION _____

Epistemology

5 There is a comprehensive view of Scripture and the avoidance of either a tendency to ignore Scripture or to proof text.

2 Psychological theory and research are reviewed and integrated into this model.

Comment:

Integration approach does consider scripture and in fact the three dimensions of Christian mental health care that this approach considers correlates with the three areas of the imago Dei - functional, structural and relational. This approach, however, lacks empirical validation.

Appreciation for Science of Psychology

5 A specific theory is easily identified (e.g., Freudian, Adlerian, Behavioral, Cognitive, Neuroscience, etc.) or model is clearly identified as eclectic.

3 The author is conversant with research and does not use psychological “proof-texting.”

Comment:

**The model is easily identified as integrated (not eclectic) using cognitive restructuring, symptom-focused interventions and schema-focused interventions
While the model does lack empirical validity, the author does not appear to take statements out of context but gives a valid interpretation of soul care integrating psychology and theology. The imago Dei and the three interconnected domains of interventions**

Relationship of Psychology and Theology

5 A specific family of theology is easily identified (e.g., Reformed, Wesleyan, Evangelical, Charismatic, etc.) or the model is clearly identified as eclectic.

5 The author’s use of the term “integration” is clearly explained.

Comment:

The theology of this model appears to be evangelical and the approach integrates psychology, theology and spirituality where the counselor is sensitive to situations and adapts usage of the different realms of authority depending on the situation. The therapist understands and counsels with the knowledge of imago Dei and the creation of humans in God’s image – functional, structural and relational.

View of Humanity

5 The model takes into account a Biblical view of humanity.

4 This view is informed from both theology and psychology.

Comment:

The approach does consider the Biblical view of humanity as it references the imago Dei and addresses functional, structural and relational issues.

Role of Christ and Holy Spirit

3 The role of the cross of Christ is clearly delineated.

3 The role of the Holy Spirit is addressed.

Comment:

Although not clearly delineated, the role of Christ as redeemer can be assumed. This approach acknowledges the role of the Holy Spirit stirring in the lives of the counselor and client when effective counseling is taking place.

Nature of Health and Disorder

4 The goal of growth includes both psychological health and spiritual maturity and these goals are clearly defined.

4 A distinction between spiritual and psychological suffering is made.

4 Disorder is clearly explained (e.g., A view of sin versus psychopathology is clearly articulated)

5 A place is given for physical symptoms (and appropriate medical referrals are suggested).

Comment:

The goal of growth includes psychological health and spiritual maturity which is achieved using treatment plans that consider schema-focused strategies. The client's disorder is explained through addressing the functional, structural and relational issues and medical referrals are given.

Nature of change

3 The model makes use of psychological techniques, biblical truth and spiritual disciplines.

4 The role of the counselor is clearly delineated.

4 The contrast between symptom reduction, positive mental health and spiritual maturity is addressed in a cohesive fashion.

Comment:

Psychological techniques are used based on the notion of the imago Dei for an understanding of psychological health. Psychology and spirituality absorbs each other to produce psychospiritual wholeness

Use of Religious Techniques and Practices

3 If the use of religious or spiritual techniques with clients is recommended, this is done within a framework of professional ethics.

2 The model clearly describes whether these techniques are used for psychological or spiritual goals.

Comment: It was not clear as to whether the techniques were for psychological or spiritual goals. All of the techniques including recursive schema therapy appear to be psychological.

Overall Assessment

5 This model can be easily incorporated into clinical practice? (Which, if any, settings would be more difficult?)

5 I would refer my mother to a therapist using this model.

Comment:

This model can be easily incorporated into a Christian clinical practice as it draws from both spiritual and secular sources to promote change. I would not hesitate to refer my mother to a therapist using this model.

Evaluation of Integration Model

Describe the model you are examining using each of the following categories. For each subcategory, rate on a scale of 1 to 5 (with 5 representing an “ideal” approach). Write supporting comments.

Identification of Model: CHRISTIAN PSYCHOLOGY

Epistemology

5 There is a comprehensive view of Scripture and the avoidance of either a tendency to ignore Scripture or to proof text.

2 Psychological theory and research are reviewed and integrated into this model.

Comment:

The counselor brings the mind of Christ in the therapeutic alliance where the counselor is using historical Christian literature and gleaned from secular theories and techniques.

Appreciation for Science of Psychology

2 A specific theory is easily identified (e.g., Freudian, Adlerian, Behavioral, Cognitive, Neuroscience, etc.) or model is clearly identified as eclectic.

4 The author is conversant with research and does not use psychological “proof-texting.”

Comment:

Christian psychology must be consistent with two presumptions: reading Christian literature/knowing Christian traditions and reading/learning from other psychological communities. Christian psychology seeks to uncover the psychology implicit in historic Christian writings including the Bible. Although interventions may be organized around a trauma model, a specific theory is not easily identified.

Relationship of Psychology and Theology

4 A specific family of theology is easily identified (e.g., Reformed, Wesleyan, Evangelical, Charismatic, etc.) or the model is clearly identified as eclectic.

3 The author’s use of the term “integration” is clearly explained.

Comment:

The family of theology is not clearly identifiable. The theology shows the manifestation of God through history where there is a high view of God’s word and the Bible stories. It appears more eclectic than redemptive. It is based on the knowledge and understanding of the personality of Jesus Christ. Christian psychology understands the psychological nature of humans through Christianity but does not clearly show an integration.

View of Humanity

5 The model takes into account a Biblical view of humanity.

2 This view is informed from both theology and psychology.

Comment:

This approach considers a Biblical view of humanity. The psychological nature of humans is described according to historic Christianity. This approach wants the science of psychology to be rediscovered within Christianity.

Role of Christ and Holy Spirit

5 The role of the cross of Christ is clearly delineated.

5 The role of the Holy Spirit is addressed.

Comment:

This approach calls for the counselor to immerse themselves in the scriptures and be Christlike. The counselor must rely on direction from the Spirit of God.

Nature of Health and Disorder

4 The goal of growth includes both psychological health and spiritual maturity and these goals are clearly defined.

4 A distinction between spiritual and psychological suffering is made.

4 Disorder is clearly explained (e.g., A view of sin versus psychopathology is clearly articulated)

4 A place is given for physical symptoms (and appropriate medical referrals are suggested).

Comment:

Although pathology is considered, it is not the main focus. The focus is forming a therapeutic alliance along with developing a community to strengthen the client. The approach suggests including necessary personnel to help

Nature of change

4 The model makes use of psychological techniques, biblical truth and spiritual disciplines.

5 The role of the counselor is clearly delineated.

4 The contrast between symptom reduction, positive mental health and spiritual maturity is addressed in a cohesive fashion.

Comment:

While the counselor is coming from a Christian perspective, he/she must understand empirical literature to be able to treat various pathologies. The counselor will use empirical base techniques along with relying on God for direction as he/she believes God's redemptive work addresses all issues. The goal is symptom reduction with obtaining positive mental health along with spiritual maturity. All of which should be modeled in the God-dependent counselor.

Use of Religious Techniques and Practices

4 If the use of religious or spiritual techniques with clients is recommended, this is done within a framework of professional ethics.

4 The model clearly describes whether these techniques are used for psychological or spiritual goals.

Comment:

The model values Biblical insights and a team approach to facilitate healing. For example, spiritual guided forgiveness might be used to help client with familial emotional problems and psychotherapeutic techniques might be used for DSM 5 diagnoses. This approach still requires empirical evidence as to the integration or use of techniques

Overall Assessment

3 This model can be easily incorporated into clinical practice? (Which, if any, settings would be more difficult?)

2 I would refer my mother to a therapist using this model.

Comment:

Since this approach needs to be empirically validated and the practical applications were not tangible, I would not refer my mother. This approach depends on the counselor's relationship with God which possibly limits the clientele population to Christians.

Evaluation of Integration Model

Describe the model you are examining using each of the following categories. For each subcategory, rate on a scale of 1 to 5 (with 5 representing an “ideal” approach). Write supporting comments.

TRANSFORMATIONAL

Identification of Model: _____

Epistemology

4 There is a comprehensive view of Scripture and the avoidance of either a tendency to ignore Scripture or to proof text.

1 Psychological theory and research are reviewed and integrated into this model.

Comment:

There is a comprehensive view of Scripture as the goal is for the client to enter into a transforming friendship with the Trinity – God the Father, God the Son and God the Holy Spirit. This approach ignores science. There is no discussion regarding psychological theory and research.

Appreciation for Science of Psychology

1 A specific theory is easily identified (e.g., Freudian, Adlerian, Behavioral, Cognitive, Neuroscience, etc.) or model is clearly identified as eclectic.

1 The author is conversant with research and does not use psychological “proof-texting.”

Comment:

There is no specific identifiable theory. This approach appears unstructured where techniques or other approaches are used dependent upon the client’s circumstances/situation. The author does not use psychological “proof-texting” as this approach lacks empirical evidence and the author does not discuss research.

Relationship of Psychology and Theology

4 A specific family of theology is easily identified (e.g., Reformed, Wesleyan, Evangelical, Charismatic, etc.) or the model is clearly identified as eclectic.

2 The author’s use of the term “integration” is clearly explained.

Comment:

The theology identified with this approach is Evangelical. The primary focus is a personal spiritual transformation for both the counselor and counselee. Although this approach looks for ways to incorporate insights and techniques from the other approaches, the term integration is not clearly explained. There is no explanation of an integration of the relationship of psychology and theology.

View of Humanity

5 The model takes into account a Biblical view of humanity.

1 This view is informed from both theology and psychology.

Comment:

This approach takes a high view of the scriptures and the authority of God’s word. Humanity is definitely considered through a Biblical lens. The Spirit of God is the source and instrument of change. The view is informed from theology not psychology.

Role of Christ and Holy Spirit

5 The role of the cross of Christ is clearly delineated.

5 The role of the Holy Spirit is addressed.

Comment:

This approach is fundamentally relational with a purpose of loving God and your neighbor. The role of Christ is clearly delineated as the place where transformation takes place. The role of the Holy Spirit is addressed as being part of the spiritual resources needed for salvation, sanctification or life change.

Nature of Health and Disorder

4 The goal of growth includes both psychological health and spiritual maturity and these goals are clearly defined.

3 A distinction between spiritual and psychological suffering is made.

2 Disorder is clearly explained (e.g., A view of sin versus psychopathology is clearly articulated)

4 A place is given for physical symptoms (and appropriate medical referrals are suggested).

Comment:

The goal of growth is spiritual which will in turn facilitate psychological health. This approach focuses on issues/behavioral problems that are categorized as matters of the spirit and soul. Although some pathology, in this approach, may be viewed in terms of the DSM V, like maladaptive functioning, pathology is basically viewed as living apart from God. Referrals are made.

Nature of change

2 The model makes use of psychological techniques, biblical truth and spiritual disciplines.

4 The role of the counselor is clearly delineated.

3 The contrast between symptom reduction, positive mental health and spiritual maturity is addressed in a cohesive fashion.

Comment:

It is not ideal because the model uses scriptural truths as the foundation and incorporates spiritual disciplines. The goal is that the counselor and client will strive to be more Christlike. The counselor offers “soul care” with this approach and symptom reduction and positive mental health is achieved with spiritual maturity.

Use of Religious Techniques and Practices

4 If the use of religious or spiritual techniques with clients is recommended, this is done within a framework of professional ethics.

4 The model clearly describes whether these techniques are used for psychological or spiritual goals.

Comment:

The model is clear in the use of a spiritual disciplines and that the Biblical counseling model should not be compromised with contradictory approaches by outside referrals. It is ethical because the client is aware from the intake of the spiritual overview in this approach where spiritual techniques will be used.

Overall Assessment

2 This model can be easily incorporated into clinical practice? (Which, if any, settings would be more difficult?)

1 I would refer my mother to a therapist using this model.

Comment:

This model is easily not easily incorporated as it is using spiritual disciplines where spiritual disciplines might not be suitable for every client and every situation. I would not refer my mother as this model is unstructured with its approach. The counselor uses an approach depending on the situation.

client see how Christ and the Holy Spirit can and should make a difference in their daily circumstances, beliefs, thoughts and actions.

Nature of Health and Disorder

3 The goal of growth includes both psychological health and spiritual maturity and these goals are clearly defined.

2 A distinction between spiritual and psychological suffering is made.

2 Disorder is clearly explained (e.g., A view of sin versus psychopathology is clearly articulated)

4 A place is given for physical symptoms (and appropriate medical referrals are suggested).

Comment:

The author mentions medical/physical needs being addressed by appropriate medical and occupational assistance. The Biblical counselor's goals, however, are spiritual and suffering is caused by being far from God. The Biblical counselor does not address the validity of a client's previous diagnoses but focuses on issues that can be addressed spiritually.

Nature of change

1 The model makes use of psychological techniques, biblical truth and spiritual disciplines.

4 The role of the counselor is clearly delineated.

2 The contrast between symptom reduction, positive mental health and spiritual maturity is addressed in a cohesive fashion.

Comment:

This model does not specifically use psychological techniques. The counseling is condensed into three methodological commitments which are spiritual. The role of the counselor is delineated in that the counselor should reflect Christ in the counseling room.

Use of Religious Techniques and Practices

5 If the use of religious or spiritual techniques with clients is recommended, this is done within a framework of professional ethics.

4 The model clearly describes whether these techniques are used for psychological or spiritual goals.

Comment:

The author does explain that Biblical counseling is using spiritual techniques. The client is encouraged to act on the knowledge God rather than seek more spiritual experiences. Their knowledge of the gospel is transforming if the client acts upon that knowledge. The goals are spiritual and is done within a framework of professional ethics.

Overall Assessment

3 This model can be easily incorporated into clinical practice? (Which, if any, settings would be more difficult?)

3 I would refer my mother to a therapist using this model.

Comment:

This model is not easily incorporated into a clinical practice as it is more pastoral than clinical. I would not refer my mother to a Biblical counselor unless she was seeking pastoral care for spiritual concerns.